

# **Validated Document in the Andean Subregion**

# REGIONAL GOALS FOR HUMAN RESOURCES FOR HEALTH INDICATORS 2007-2015

DATA COLLECTION GUIDE TO BUILD THE REGIONAL GOALS FOR HUMAN RESOURCES FOR HEALTH INDICATORS 2007-2015

This document is the result of a work and validation process carried out under the coordination of Dr. Mónica Padilla. The technical design, systematization and documented edition was developed by Margarita Velasco and Alexandra Escobar¹; with the participation of Andean country members and PAHO consultants from HSS, as well as Human Resources (Miriam Gamboa, Hugo Rivera; Luis Carlos Ortiz, Hernando Cubides, Gerardo Alfaro; Verónica Bustos, Jaques Girard; Eduardo Puente, Jorge Alban, Cristina Merino; Betsy Moscoso, Giovanni Escalante and Marco Ramírez, with the support of Dr. Félix Rigoli and Allison Foster from the PAHO/WHO Regional Office.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> Consultants from Fundación Observatorio Social from Ecuador – entity with a wide experience on the formulation, follow-up and production of social indicators- in Ecuador, one of their main developments has been the Children's Rights Observatory – with the creation of indices and indicators to develop citizen oversight over their fulfillment.

#### **GENERAL INDICATIONS**

The Regional HRH goals are inspired on the 5 Toronto challenges, which were transformed into 20 measurable goals: some quantitative, others qualitative. The objective of this operation was to monitor the agreements achieved in Toronto by the countries in the Region.

PAHO-WHO elaborated a "Handbook for Baseline studies" of the 20 goals, where the Toronto Challenges are described, the sense or rationale for the goals and key terms are defined to create uniform concepts used for data collection. Additionally, the indicator, formula and definition are included where certain concept elements are described, and finally, the sources where data may be obtained.

#### First step

We recommend beginning the data collection process by analyzing the previously mentioned Manual, given that this tool will allow you to comprehend the magnitude of the task related to building baseline indicators for a country.

## **Second step**

The second step is dealing with the sources of information in each country and defining which and what type (administrative records, specific studies, censuses), periodicity of information, their geographical, gender or professional categories, and if these will allow you to calculate the proposed indicators. This guide precisely addresses these sources of information.

#### Third step

The third step is calculating the indicators, an activity that will be carried out in a workshop with the support of the team in Ecuador, since they have already defined their baseline indicators. It is their experience with managing data sources that has allowed us to develop some advice on each of the indicators and the reach of their elements, as well as where they can be found.

#### **SOURCES OF DATA**

After analyzing the 20 goals converted into social indicators, we may classify them in the following manner according to the source of information:

Goal number and indicator	Administrative records	Surveys	Interviews to key informants
Goal 1			
Human Resources density ratio per	X		
10,000 inhabitants	Statistics Institutes		

Soal 2	Goal number and indicator	Administrative records	Surveys	Interviews to key informants
physicians as a percent of the total medical work force  Goal 3  Degree of development of primary health care teams  Goal 4  Ratio of doctors with regards to nurses Goal 5  Level of development of the Human Resources for Health Unit  Goal 6  Consist of Human Resources (total number of physicians, nurses and midwives per 10,000 population) in the rural areas of the country. Density of Human Resources (total number of physicians, nurses and midwives per 10,000 population) for urban areas in the country. Persentage of primary health workers that have public health and intercultural competencies  Goal 8  Percentage of training programs for the designated professional groups (nurses, nurse auxiliaries, health technicians and community health workers) that match or surpass the stated requirements for their current positions.  Goal 9  Goal 10  Adoption of the global code of practice  Goal 11  Country  Existence of a self-sufficiency policy in human resources for health. Yes or	Goal 2			
Moder   Mode	Number of primary health care	X		
Goal 3 Degree of development of primary health care teams Goal 4 Ratio of doctors with regards to nurses Goal 5 Level of development of the Human Resources for Health Unit Goal 6 Density of Human Resources (total number of physicians, nurses and midwives per 10,000 population) in the rural areas of the country. Density of Human Resources (total number of physicians, nurses and midwives per 10,000 population) for urban areas in the country. Density of Human Resources (total number of physicians, nurses and midwives per 10,000 population) for urban areas in the country.  Goal 7 Percentage of primary health workers that have public health and intercultural competencies Goal 8 Percentage of training programs for the designated professional groups (nurses, nurse auxiliaries, health technicians and community health workers) that match or surpass the stated requirements for their current positions.  Goal 9 Percentage of health workers whose current primary health care practice setting is the same geographic location as their own community.  Goal 10 Adoption of the global code of practice  Goal 11 Country Existence of a self-sufficiency policy in human resources for health. Yes or	physicians as a percent of the total	Statistics Institutes		
Degree of development of primary health care teams  Goal 4  Ratio of doctors with regards to nurses  Goal 5  Level of development of the Human Resources (total number of physicians, nurses and midwives per 10,000 population) in the rural areas of the country.  Density of Human Resources (total number of physicians, nurses and midwives per 10,000 population) for urban areas in the country.  Goal 7  Percentage of primary health workers that have public health and intercultural competencies  Goal 8  Percentage of training programs for the designated professional groups (nurses, nurse auxiliaries, health exchnicians and community health workers) that match or surpass the stated requirements for their current positions.  Goal 9  Percentage of health workers whose current primary health care practice setting is the same geographic location as their own community.  Goal 10  Adoption of the global code of practice  Goal 11  Country  Existence of a self-sufficiency policy in human resources for health. Yes or	medical work force			
Realth care teams   X   X   Ratio of doctors with regards to nurses   Soal 5     Level of development of the Human Resources for Health Unit   Soal 6     Density of Human Resources (total number of physicians, nurses and midwives per 10,000 population) in the rural areas of the country. Density of Human Resources (total number of physicians, nurses and midwives per 10,000 population) for urban areas in the country	Goal 3			
Realth care teams   X   X   Ratio of doctors with regards to nurses   Soal 5     Level of development of the Human Resources for Health Unit   Soal 6     Density of Human Resources (total number of physicians, nurses and midwives per 10,000 population) in the rural areas of the country. Density of Human Resources (total number of physicians, nurses and midwives per 10,000 population) for urban areas in the country	Degree of development of primary	X		X
Ratio of doctors with regards to nurses  Goal 5  Level of development of the Human Resources for Health Unit  Goal 6  Density of Human Resources (total number of physicians, nurses and midwives per 10,000 population) in the rural areas of the country. Density of Human Resources (total number of physicians, nurses and midwives per 10,000 population) for urban areas in the country.  Percentage of primary health workers that have public health and intercultural competencies  Goal 8  Percentage of training programs for the designated professional groups (nurses, nurse auxiliaries, health technicians and community health workers) that match or surpass the stated requirements for their current positions.  Goal 9  Percentage of health workers whose current primary health workers whose current primary health care practice setting is the same geographic location as their own community.  Goal 10  Adoption of the global code of practice  Goal 11  Country  Existence of a self-sufficiency policy in human resources for health. Yes or				
Roal 5 Level of development of the Human Resources for Health Unit  Goal 6 Density of Human Resources (total number of physicians, nurses and midwives per 10,000 population) in the rural areas of the country. Density of Human Resources (total number of physicians, nurses and midwives per 10,000 population) for urban areas in the country  Goal 7 Percentage of primary health workers that have public health and intercultural competencies  Goal 8 Percentage of training programs for the designated professional groups (nurses, nurse auxilliaries, health technicians and community health workers) that match or surpass the stated requirements for their current positions.  Goal 9 Percentage of health workers whose current primary health care practice setting is the same geographic location as their own community.  Goal 10 Adoption of the global code of practice  MoH. International Affairs.  MoH. International Affairs.  X  X  WHRH Unit MoH  HRH Unit MoH  Affairs.  X  HRH Unit MoH  HRH Unit MoH  X  X  X  X  X  X  X  X  X  X  X  X  X	Goal 4	X		
Roal 5 Level of development of the Human Resources for Health Unit  Goal 6 Density of Human Resources (total number of physicians, nurses and midwives per 10,000 population) in the rural areas of the country. Density of Human Resources (total number of physicians, nurses and midwives per 10,000 population) for urban areas in the country.  Goal 7 Percentage of primary health workers that have public health and intercultural competencies  Goal 8 Percentage of training programs for the designated professional groups (nurses, nurse auxiliaries, health technicians and community health workers) that match or surpass the stated requirements for their current positions.  Goal 9 Percentage of health workers whose current primary health care practice setting is the same geographic location as their own community.  Goal 10 Adoption of the global code of practice  Goal 11 Country Existence of a self-sufficiency policy in human resources for health. Yes or	Ratio of doctors with regards to	Statistics Institutes		
Level of development of the Human Resources for Health Unit  Goal 6  Density of Human Resources (total number of physicians, nurses and midwives per 10,000 population) in the rural areas of the country. Density of Human Resources (total number of physicians, nurses and midwives per 10,000 population) for urban areas in the country  Goal 7  Percentage of primary health workers that have public health and intercultural competencies  Goal 8  Percentage of training programs for the designated professional groups (nurses, nurse auxiliaries, health technicians and community health workers) that match or surpass the stated requirements for their current positions.  Goal 9  Percentage of health workers whose current primary health care practice setting is the same geographic location as their own community.  Goal 10  Adoption of the global code of practice  Goal 11  Country  Existence of a self-sufficiency policy in human resources for health. Yes or	<u> </u>			
Resources for Health Unit Goal 6 Density of Human Resources (total number of physicians, nurses and midwives per 10,000 population) in the rural areas of the country. Density of Human Resources (total number of physicians, nurses and midwives per 10,000 population) for urban areas in the country.  Goal 7 Percentage of primary health workers that have public health and intercultural competencies  Goal 8 Percentage of training programs for the designated professional groups (nurses, nurse auxiliaries, health technicians and community health workers) that match or surpass the stated requirements for their current positions.  Goal 9 Percentage of health workers whose current primary health care practice setting is the same geographic location as their own community.  Goal 10 Adoption of the global code of practice  Goal 11 Country Existence of a self-sufficiency policy in human resources for health. Yes or	Goal 5			
Resources for Health Unit Goal 6 Density of Human Resources (total number of physicians, nurses and midwives per 10,000 population) in the rural areas of the country. Density of Human Resources (total number of physicians, nurses and midwives per 10,000 population) for urban areas in the country.  Goal 7 Percentage of primary health workers that have public health and intercultural competencies  Goal 8 Percentage of training programs for the designated professional groups (nurses, nurse auxiliaries, health technicians and community health workers) that match or surpass the stated requirements for their current positions.  Goal 9 Percentage of health workers whose current primary health care practice setting is the same geographic location as their own community.  Goal 10 Adoption of the global code of practice  Goal 11 Country Existence of a self-sufficiency policy in human resources for health. Yes or	Level of development of the Human			X
Density of Human Resources (total number of physicians, nurses and midwives per 10,000 population) in the rural areas of the country.  Density of Human Resources (total number of physicians, nurses and midwives per 10,000 population) for urban areas in the country.  Goal 7  Percentage of primary health workers that have public health and intercultural competencies  Goal 8  Percentage of training programs for the designated professional groups (nurses, nurse auxiliaries, health technicians and community health workers) that match or surpass the stated requirements for their current positions.  Goal 9  Percentage of health workers whose current primary health care practice setting is the same geographic location as their own community.  Goal 10  Adoption of the global code of practice  Goal 11  Country  Existence of a self-sufficiency policy in human resources for health. Yes or				
Density of Human Resources (total number of physicians, nurses and midwives per 10,000 population) in the rural areas of the country.  Density of Human Resources (total number of physicians, nurses and midwives per 10,000 population) for urban areas in the country.  Goal 7  Percentage of primary health workers that have public health and intercultural competencies  Goal 8  Percentage of training programs for the designated professional groups (nurses, nurse auxiliaries, health technicians and community health workers) that match or surpass the stated requirements for their current positions.  Goal 9  Percentage of health workers whose current primary health care practice setting is the same geographic location as their own community.  Goal 10  Adoption of the global code of practice  Goal 11  Country  Existence of a self-sufficiency policy in human resources for health. Yes or		Statistics Institutes	X	
number of physicians, nurses and midwives per 10,000 population) in the rural areas of the country. Density of Human Resources (total number of physicians, nurses and midwives per 10,000 population) for urban areas in the country.  Goal 7 Percentage of primary health workers that have public health and intercultural competencies  Goal 8 Percentage of training programs for the designated professional groups (nurses, nurse auxiliaries, health technicians and community health workers) that match or surpass the stated requirements for their current positions.  Goal 9 Percentage of health workers whose current primary health care practice setting is the same geographic location as their own community.  Goal 10 Adoption of the global code of practice  Goal 11 Country Existence of a self-sufficiency policy in human resources for health. Yes or	Density of Human Resources (total		Household	
midwives per 10,000 population) in the rural areas of the country.  Density of Human Resources (total number of physicians, nurses and midwives per 10,000 population) for urban areas in the country  Goal 7  Percentage of primary health workers that have public health and intercultural competencies  Goal 8  Percentage of training programs for the designated professional groups (nurses, nurse auxiliaries, health technicians and community health workers) that match or surpass the stated requirements for their current positions.  Goal 9  Percentage of health workers whose current primary health care practice setting is the same geographic location as their own community.  Goal 10  Adoption of the global code of practice  Goal 11  Country  Existence of a self-sufficiency policy in human resources for health. Yes or				
the rural areas of the country. Density of Human Resources (total number of physicians, nurses and midwives per 10,000 population) for urban areas in the country  Goal 7 Percentage of primary health workers that have public health and intercultural competencies  Goal 8 Percentage of training programs for the designated professional groups (nurses, nurse auxiliaries, health technicians and community health workers) that match or surpass the stated requirements for their current positions.  Goal 9 Percentage of health workers whose current primary health care practice setting is the same geographic location as their own community.  Goal 10 Adoption of the global code of practice  Goal 11 Country Existence of a self-sufficiency policy in human resources for health. Yes or				
Density of Human Resources (total number of physicians, nurses and midwives per 10,000 population) for urban areas in the country  Goal 7  Percentage of primary health workers that have public health and intercultural competencies  Goal 8  Percentage of training programs for the designated professional groups (nurses, nurse auxiliaries, health technicians and community health workers) that match or surpass the stated requirements for their current positions.  Goal 9  Percentage of health workers whose current primary health care practice setting is the same geographic location as their own community.  Goal 10  Adoption of the global code of practice  Goal 11  Country  Existence of a self-sufficiency policy in human resources for health. Yes or				
number of physicians, nurses and midwives per 10,000 population) for urban areas in the country  Goal 7  Percentage of primary health workers that have public health and intercultural competencies  Goal 8  Percentage of training programs for the designated professional groups (nurses, nurse auxiliaries, health technicians and community health workers) that match or surpass the stated requirements for their current positions.  Goal 9  Percentage of health workers whose current primary health care practice setting is the same geographic location as their own community.  Goal 10  Adoption of the global code of practice  Goal 11  Country  Existence of a self-sufficiency policy in human resources for health. Yes or				
midwives per 10,000 population) for urban areas in the country  Goal 7 Percentage of primary health workers that have public health and intercultural competencies  Goal 8 Percentage of training programs for the designated professional groups (nurses, nurse auxiliaries, health technicians and community health workers) that match or surpass the stated requirements for their current positions.  Goal 9 Percentage of health workers whose current primary health care practice setting is the same geographic location as their own community.  Goal 10 Adoption of the global code of practice  Goal 11 Country Existence of a self-sufficiency policy in human resources for health. Yes or				
urban areas in the country  Goal 7 Percentage of primary health workers that have public health and intercultural competencies  Goal 8 Percentage of training programs for the designated professional groups (nurses, nurse auxiliaries, health technicians and community health workers) that match or surpass the stated requirements for their current positions.  Goal 9 Percentage of health workers whose current primary health care practice setting is the same geographic location as their own community.  Goal 10 Adoption of the global code of practice  Goal 11 Country Existence of a self-sufficiency policy in human resources for health. Yes or				
Percentage of primary health workers that have public health and intercultural competencies   MoH				
Percentage of primary health workers that have public health and intercultural competencies  Goal 8  Percentage of training programs for the designated professional groups (nurses, nurse auxiliaries, health technicians and community health workers) that match or surpass the stated requirements for their current positions.  Goal 9  Percentage of health workers whose current primary health care practice setting is the same geographic location as their own community.  Goal 10  Adoption of the global code of practice  Goal 11  Country  Existence of a self-sufficiency policy in human resources for health. Yes or				
that have public health and intercultural competencies  Goal 8  Percentage of training programs for the designated professional groups (nurses, nurse auxiliaries, health technicians and community health workers) that match or surpass the stated requirements for their current positions.  Goal 9  Percentage of health workers whose current primary health care practice setting is the same geographic location as their own community.  Goal 10  Adoption of the global code of practice  Goal 11  Country  Existence of a self-sufficiency policy in human resources for health. Yes or		MoH	X	X
intercultural competencies  Goal 8  Percentage of training programs for the designated professional groups (nurses, nurse auxiliaries, health technicians and community health workers) that match or surpass the stated requirements for their current positions.  Goal 9  Percentage of health workers whose current primary health care practice setting is the same geographic location as their own community.  Goal 10  Adoption of the global code of practice  Goal 11  Country  Existence of a self-sufficiency policy in human resources for health. Yes or		_		
Goal 8 Percentage of training programs for the designated professional groups (nurses, nurse auxiliaries, health technicians and community health workers) that match or surpass the stated requirements for their current positions.  Goal 9 Percentage of health workers whose current primary health care practice setting is the same geographic location as their own community.  Goal 10 Adoption of the global code of practice  Goal 11 Country Existence of a self-sufficiency policy in human resources for health. Yes or				
Percentage of training programs for the designated professional groups (nurses, nurse auxiliaries, health technicians and community health workers) that match or surpass the stated requirements for their current positions.  Goal 9 Percentage of health workers whose current primary health care practice setting is the same geographic location as their own community.  Goal 10 Adoption of the global code of practice  Goal 11 Country Existence of a self-sufficiency policy in human resources for health. Yes or				
the designated professional groups (nurses, nurse auxiliaries, health technicians and community health workers) that match or surpass the stated requirements for their current positions.  Goal 9 Percentage of health workers whose current primary health care practice setting is the same geographic location as their own community.  Goal 10 Adoption of the global code of practice  Goal 11 Country Existence of a self-sufficiency policy in human resources for health. Yes or				
(nurses, nurse auxiliaries, health technicians and community health workers) that match or surpass the stated requirements for their current positions.  Goal 9 Percentage of health workers whose current primary health care practice setting is the same geographic location as their own community.  Goal 10 Adoption of the global code of practice  Goal 11 Country Existence of a self-sufficiency policy in human resources for health. Yes or				
technicians and community health workers) that match or surpass the stated requirements for their current positions.  Goal 9 Percentage of health workers whose current primary health care practice setting is the same geographic location as their own community.  Goal 10 Adoption of the global code of practice  Goal 11 Country Existence of a self-sufficiency policy in human resources for health. Yes or		MoH		
workers) that match or surpass the stated requirements for their current positions.  Goal 9  Percentage of health workers whose current primary health care practice setting is the same geographic location as their own community.  Goal 10  Adoption of the global code of practice  Goal 11  Country  Existence of a self-sufficiency policy in human resources for health. Yes or				X
stated requirements for their current positions.  Goal 9  Percentage of health workers whose current primary health care practice setting is the same geographic location as their own community.  Goal 10  Adoption of the global code of practice  Goal 11  Country  Existence of a self-sufficiency policy in human resources for health. Yes or				
Goal 9 Percentage of health workers whose current primary health care practice setting is the same geographic location as their own community.  Goal 10 Adoption of the global code of practice  Goal 11 Country Existence of a self-sufficiency policy in human resources for health. Yes or				
Goal 9 Percentage of health workers whose current primary health care practice setting is the same geographic location as their own community.  Goal 10 Adoption of the global code of practice  Goal 11 Country Existence of a self-sufficiency policy in human resources for health. Yes or				
Percentage of health workers whose current primary health care practice setting is the same geographic location as their own community.  Goal 10 Adoption of the global code of practice  Goal 11 Country Existence of a self-sufficiency policy in human resources for health. Yes or		MoH	X specific	Х
current primary health care practice setting is the same geographic location as their own community.  Goal 10 Adoption of the global code of practice  Goal 11 Country Existence of a self-sufficiency policy in human resources for health. Yes or				-
setting is the same geographic location as their own community.  Goal 10 Adoption of the global code of practice  MoH. International Affairs Office, Ministry of Foreign Affairs.  X  Country Existence of a self-sufficiency policy in human resources for health. Yes or				
location as their own community.  Goal 10  Adoption of the global code of practice  MoH. International  Affairs Office, Ministry of Foreign Affairs.  X  Country  Existence of a self-sufficiency policy in human resources for health. Yes or				
Adoption of the global code of practice  Goal 11  Country Existence of a self-sufficiency policy in human resources for health. Yes or				
Adoption of the global code of practice  Affairs Office, Ministry of Foreign Affairs.   Goal 11  Country  Existence of a self-sufficiency policy in human resources for health. Yes or		MoH. International		Х
practice Ministry of Foreign Affairs.  Goal 11 Country HRH Unit Existence of a self-sufficiency policy in human resources for health. Yes or				
Affairs.  Country Existence of a self-sufficiency policy in human resources for health. Yes or				
Goal 11 Country Existence of a self-sufficiency policy in human resources for health. Yes or	'			
Country Existence of a self-sufficiency policy in human resources for health. Yes or	Goal 11			Х
Existence of a self-sufficiency policy in human resources for health. Yes or		HRH Unit		
in human resources for health. Yes or				
		-		
· · <del>-</del> ·	No.			

Goal number and indicator	Administrative records	Surveys	Interviews to key informants
Goal 12 Country The country has a formal mechanism for the recognition of foreign trained professionals. Yes or No.	MoH. International Affairs Office, Ministry of Foreign Affairs.		Х
Goal 13 Percentage of precarious and/or without social protection health care positions in the country	STATISTICS INSTITUTES	Х	
Goal 14 Total number of workers in the health sector covered by health and safety measures.	MoH HRH		X
Goal 15.  Number of managers with health Management training	MoH HRH		X
Goal 16. Current existence of legislation seeking to avoid the suspension of Essentials health services	Ministry of Labor. MoH: HRH Unit.		Х
Goal 17. Inclusion of PHC contents in the content and practical sections of the curriculum Existence of inter-professional strategies in clinical health sciences schools. Existence of financial support for inter-professional training	Universities CONESUP – Higher Education Council		X
Goal 18.  Existence of enrollment programs (selective candidate recruitment, affirmative action) in clinical health science schools to include students from underserved populations	Universities CONESUP – Higher Education Council	Specific studies	X
Goal 19 Percentage of medical and nursing students that abandon the career	Universities CONESUP – Higher Education Council	X or specific studies	
Goal 20 Existence of an accrediting entity Percentage of accredited Colleges and/or Schools of Clinical Health Sciences Percentage of accredited Colleges and/or Schools of Public Health Number of Colleges and/or Schools of Clinical Health Sciences and Public Health in the process of accreditation.	Universities CONESUP – Higher Education Council	X	X

#### **BASIC CONCEPTS**

#### Administrative records

Periodic collection of information in institutions offering social services. One of the advantages is the periodicity and updated nature of the information. Among the disadvantages is that information is dependent of the degree of uniform training of the personnel systematically collecting the data, since any change can alter the sequence of information. Another disadvantage is that it is circumscribed under the institutional coverage and may therefore not reflect the data of the entire universe of data.

#### Surveys

Studies directed towards collecting data from a sample of the population we are interested in. It is designed to contain all of the possible variations in the universe of study.

#### Advantages:

It is a good way to update information and due to their cost they are feasible to perform. They may be designed to capture the perception of the population which means they can be used for qualitative or quantitative studies.

### Disadvantages:

The information cannot be broken down to geographical areas. Its quality depends on the expertise of the person conducting the survey and the control on information taking. Its periodicity is dependant on financing. They need to be carefully replicated in order to achieve comparability from one year to the other.

#### Censuses

It involves counting the characteristics of the universe or the study population. They are carried out every 10 years. The main advantage is high precision rates, achieving the lowest levels of disaggregation. Disadvantages are the high cost implicated with doing them.

### Specific studies

This refers to particular studies around a defined hypothesis or question. It allows us to gauge the magnitude of the problem to open new questions, therefore leading to other studies. Its disadvantage is that they are not carried out periodically and you may lose the sequence of information.