Systems and approach for NHWA implementation at national level

Dr Khassoum DIALLO,
Coordinator, Data, Evidence and Knowledge Management
HWF Dept, UHC Division
WHO Geneva

PAHO Regional NHWA workshop, Brasilia August 2019
Data is required to inform HRH Challenges

- Shortage of Health Workforce
- Massive Health Workforce Migration
- Skewed Geographic Distribution
- Skill Mix Imbalance
- Evolving HWF Demography
- Massive Health Workforce Migration
- Sub-optimum Productivity
- Focus on training
- Link to policy

**HRH Challenges**
Strategic Areas and actions for addressing key HRH data challenges

- Policies
- IT systems /Tools
- Knowledge Management
- Multisectoral Governance
- Legal basis for data sharing
- Indicators
- Data Flow
- Data Sources
- Data Dissemination & Use

Figure 3. Strategic Actions for Implementation of NHWA
Strategic Actions for addressing key HRH data challenges

Policies

Governance

Data Sources

Data Flow

Data Analysis, Dissemination & Use

Data management tools

Priority HRH challenges
Buy-in by decision makers / Alignment with needs / Funding

Multi-sectoral approach - Involvement of non-health sectors – Private sector, regulatory bodies and professional associations – Data exchange procedures

Comprehensiveness, quality, Coordination, inclusiveness, inter-operability of systems, data for decision-making
Some common HIS/HRHIS challenges

• Fragmentation of systems
• Inter-operability challenges
• Data collection not guided by policy questions and needs for decision making
• Multiplicity of tools and processes
• Lack of common data definitions and standards
• Weak and not inclusive governance mechanisms
• Limited funding for HIS/HRHIS
• Limited use of data at collection points: Collecting for reporting
• Technical capacity of data collectors
Strengthening HRH Information systems: Three phases

Phase I
Conceptualization

Phase II
Operationalization

Phase III
Process revision and sustainability
Implementation of the NHWA
8 steps

1. Governmental “buy-in”
2. Governance
3. Scoping and planning
4. Legal framework
5. Data compilation and analysis
6. Validation
7. Dissemination
8. Process revision

Phase I
Conceptualization

Phase II
Operationalization

Phase III
Process revision and sustainability
1. Governmental “buy-in”

2. Governance

3. Scoping and planning

4. Legal framework

5. Data compilation and analysis

6. Validation

7. Dissemination

8. Process revision
## Step 1: Governmental “buy-in”

### Objectives

- Obtain political commitment to strengthen HRH data
- Ensure adoption of the NHWA framework by the Ministry of Health
- Fulfil initial steps to coordinate intersectoral health workforce agenda

### Tasks and activities

- A health workforce representative within the Ministry of Health is identified to become the NHWA focal point
- All available support resources are grouped together for the NHWA
- A short paper (brief) is prepared to recapitulate the need for the NHWA
- Existing information systems relevant for NHWA are identified
- Documents and other requirements for obtaining Ministry of Health approval are prepared

### Main outputs

- Ministry of Health takes leadership to strengthen HRH data for the NHWA
- Implementation is initiated, with a multiyear plan
## Step 2: Governance

### Objective

Establish a governance structure for the NHWA with representatives from relevant sectors and stakeholders

### Tasks and activities

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Main outputs</th>
<th>Tasks and activities</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>A multisector, multistakeholder coordination working group is established</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Governance and coordination mechanisms are defined</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Key policy questions are adopted</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A secretariat is established</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A communications structure is set up</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

- Stakeholder mapping is conducted/updated by the Ministry of Health focal point
- A focal point is nominated by each stakeholder
- A multisector, multistakeholder coordination working group is set up and adopted with governance, coordination mechanisms and terms of reference
- A secretariat is nominated in charge of centralizing summary data and organizing the preparation of documents and meetings
- A technical working group is nominated by the multistakeholder working group be in charge of data gathering and analysis
- A series of key policy questions is agreed upon by the multistakeholder working group
Groups identified

Multistakeholder working group

Secretariat

MoH Focal point

Communication team

Technical working group
## Step 3: Scoping and planning

### Objectives
- Produce evidence of the state of HRH in the country as the foundation to the NHWA
- Develop a national and global dissemination plan
- Define the business plan of NHWA implementation, including gathering of catalytic funding for the initial phase

### Tasks and activities
- The technical working group is complemented, if necessary, by co-opted external experts
- A scoping analysis is conducted, NHWA indicators are reviewed, and a maturity model assessment is carried out on the NHWA online platform
- A data analysis and dissemination plan is prepared in line with the key policy questions defined in step 2
- A meeting of the multistakeholder working group is held to cost the first year and plan for a rolling budget for the NHWA

### Main outputs
- A scoping analysis is conducted and the status of HRH provided
- Costing of first year of NHWA is prepared with a plan for a rolling budget
- An analysis plan is prepared
Scoping analysis

• Used in evidence mapping
  • - Map rapidly the key concepts, sources and types of evidence available (Arksey and O’Malley, 2005)
  • - Synthesis and analysis of a wide range of research and non-research material to provide greater conceptual clarity about a specific topic or field of evidence (Davis et al, 2009)
  • - Contextualize knowledge by identifying what we know and do not know, and then setting this within policy and practice contexts (Anderson et al, 2008)
NHWA maturity assessment

Capacity of information system to generate NHWA indicators

Yes/No questions for each indicators

See presentation on data platform for more details
Legal framework

• For governance:
  - Terms of references and regulations for the multi stakeholder governance
• For data exchange
  - Data gathering, management and sharing
  - Confidentiality
  - Ethics
  - Ownership
  - Exchange with clearances, anonymization process, sensitive information management
## Step 4: Legal framework

### Objectives

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Objective</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Assess national legal environment for governance of the multistakeholder working group, data protection rules and regulations</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Obtain legal authorization for data extraction, exchange and dissemination</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ensure legal requirements are shared, and standard operating procedures (SOP) are adopted by the multistakeholder working group</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Tasks and activities

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Task</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Relevant national bodies for ethics, data confidentiality, anonymization, and data exchange to be identified by the secretariat</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Legal advice is sought by the secretariat to ensure that terms of reference and governance rules comply with national regulations</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Standard operating procedures (SOPs) are prepared by the secretariat for each type of data covering legal aspects for the dissemination of results</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SOPs include a plan to identify, report on and correct any data breach during data gathering, exchange and reporting</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Main outputs

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Output</th>
<th>Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>SOPs are elaborated</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Formal authorizations are granted for each data source</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A mitigation plan for data breach is established</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Example of Data flow I

- MoH: Number of publicly employed HR by cadre and level of care
- Ministry of finance: Average annual earning of doctors or nurses
- Professional organisations: Number of nurses or doctors member of council by age, gender
- Private sector: Number of workers working in private sector
- Secretariat:
## Step 6: Validation

### Objective

Obtain validation of NHWA data analyses, the dissemination plan and documents from the multistakeholder working group

### Tasks and activities

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Feedback and guidance on HRH data, subject to legal and practical issues, are collated from a national workshop</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>A document is drafted by the secretariat and the technical working group synthesising and translating the data for a non-specialized audience</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A formal executive meeting is convened by the secretariat with the multistakeholder group to validate the results and adopt interpretation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A final report is prepared and adopted by the multistakeholder working group</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Based on interpretation of findings, a series of key messages will target decision-makers in each sector, and others for a broader audience</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Main outputs

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Political and technical validation of the NHWA process is formalized</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Key messages to decision-makers in each sector, and to the public, are prepared</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
NHWA data process: country at the center of data collection/validation

Data entry by NHWA focal point* in NHWA online platform

Data from external partners (OECD, ICN,...)

Data collected by HQ entered in NHWA platform (LFS, census, data mining,...)

Data triangulation and validation (Countries, RO, HQ)

Validated data

Dissemination and use at all levels: Country, RO, HQ, Partner organisations

* in charge of country reporting and validation of data entered in the platform.
## Step 7: Dissemination

### Objective
Disseminate data and documents on NHWA to raise awareness on HRH

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Tasks and activities</th>
<th>Main outputs</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Target audiences are defined by the multistakeholder working group</td>
<td>A system to track dissemination of messages from HRH data is set up</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Preparation of a communication plan and diffusion of messages in various media is supported by a solid communication team</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Messages on HRH are monitored by the communication team, who gathers feedback and prepares a report for the multistakeholder working group</td>
<td>A series of communication products is released and followed up</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Scientific publications on NHWA findings could be prepared</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>If authorizations allow, disaggregated data could be released in the public domain</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Example: Decade of Health workforce strengthening

- Source: [http://apps.searo.who.int/PDS_DOCS/B5439.pdf](http://apps.searo.who.int/PDS_DOCS/B5439.pdf)
1. Governmental “buy-in”

2. Governance

3. Scoping and planning

4. Legal framework

5. Data compilation and analysis

6. Validation

7. Dissemination

8. Process revision
## Step 8: Process revision

### Objectives

- Understand the successes and failures of the initial seven steps
- Revise and update the NHWA mechanism from past experiences
- Gain political commitment and repeat elements of step 1, including obtaining sustainable funding

### Tasks and activities

- A strategic meeting with the multistakeholder working group is convened by the communication team
- Governance of the NHWA is evaluated and revised accordingly, potential new members are identified and invited, and HRH indicators are revised
- The budget for the next implementation phase is defined, such as transforming catalytic funding to a regular budget

### Main outputs

- The NHWA implementation and governance framework is revised
- A plan for inclusion of new indicators and stakeholders is established
Revision to amend the NHWA process at all steps
National Health Workforce Accounts: Scope

• Beyond a list of indicators
  • Inclusive multi-sectoral governance
  • Diversification of data sources
  • System’s strengthening approach
  • Key principle: Countries needs and interest first
• Partnership for HRH data, country support and capacity building
• Analytical work and key tools and products for country use
• Data use for decision making, raising awareness on HRH and resource mobilization
• Common open-source data platform
Technical support for NHWA implementation

- **Formal request to WHO/PAHO** (through WHO representative)
- WHO country office
- WHO regional office
- WHO headquarters

- Partners organizations

- **Joint technical support**
- WHO
Technical support for NHWA implementation (2)

• Technical support on any aspect / all steps of NHWA implementation.
• In particular:
  - HRHIS Situation analysis (stakeholders, governance,...)
  - Assessment of data quality and data flow
  - Analysis of HRH data
  - Technical support on NHWA online platform
  - NHWA for WISN
  - NHWA for Health Labour Market Analysis
  - Webinars on how to use the NHWA platform