Challenges of HRH information systems

Governance and coordination lacking

Fragmentation of systems

Health only (often public only), as a by-product of HR

Accessibility, quality and use of data

Standards lacking or not used

Capacity

Tools
Situation analysis

HRH assessment to perform:

- Governance
- Funding
- Legal
- Gaps in sources of information
- Data flow
- Coverage (private sector for profit and not for profit)
- Completeness
Implementation of the NHWA

WHO has developed an **Implementation guide** to help countries run NHWA in a sustainable manner.

Target:

- Policy makers and programme managers involved in HRH and strategy at MoH
- Other policy makers in relevant areas (education, employment and labour, social affairs,…)
- Other organization involved in HRH
- Researchers
Guiding principles

- **NHWA terminology to adapt** – HRH registry, HWF observatory, other equivalent systems

- Collaborative activity, with **multiple stakeholders** and shared responsibility in a national structure

- **Do-no-harm** approach

- Proposed steps were defined to strengthen existing system not to replace or lead to additional organizational structure.
  
  => **Use existing frameworks**

- **Not sequential approach**. To adapt to country situation
Implementation of the NHWA
Three phases

WHO has developed an **Implementation guide** to help countries run NHWA in a sustainable manner.

Three phases

Phase I
Conceptualization

Phase II
Operationalization

Phase III
Process revision and sustainability
Implementation of the NHWA
8 steps

1. Governmental “buy-in”
2. Governance
3. Scoping and planning
4. Legal framework
5. Data compilation and analysis
6. Validation
7. Dissemination
8. Process revision
## Step 1: Governmental “buy-in”

### Objectives

- Obtain political commitment to strengthen HRH data
- Ensure adoption of the NHWA framework by the Ministry of Health
- Fulfil initial steps to coordinate intersectoral health workforce agenda

### Tasks and activities

- A health workforce representative within the Ministry of Health is identified to become the NHWA focal point
- All available support resources are grouped together for the NHWA
- A short paper (brief) is prepared to recapitulate the need for the NHWA
- Existing information systems relevant for NHWA are identified
- Documents and other requirements for obtaining Ministry of Health approval are prepared

### Main outputs

- Ministry of Health takes leadership to strengthen HRH data for the NHWA
- Implementation is initiated, with a multiyear plan
Key stakeholders

- Ministry of Health
- Ministry of Education
- Ministry of Employment and Labour
- Ministry of Social Affairs
- Ministry of Economy and Finance
- Civil service commissions
- Statistical organizations
- Institutes for health at the national level
- Academia
- Health worker organizations
- Health professional councils
- Public and private insurance representatives
- Other organizations involved in monitoring and use of HRH data at subnational, national, regional and international level
Who will implement?

- Multistakeholder working group
- Secretariat
- MoH Focal point
- Communication team
- Technical working group
## Step 2: Governance

### Objective

Establish a governance structure for the NHWA with representatives from relevant sectors and stakeholders

### Tasks and activities

| Stakeholder mapping is conducted/updated by the Ministry of Health focal point |
| A focal point is nominated by each stakeholder |
| A multisector, multistakeholder coordination working group is set up and adopted with governance, coordination mechanisms and terms of reference |
| A secretariat is nominated in charge of centralizing summary data and organizing the preparation of documents and meetings |
| A technical working group is nominated by the multistakeholder working group be in charge of data gathering and analysis |
| A series of key policy questions is agreed upon by the multistakeholder working group |

### Main outputs

- A multisector, multistakeholder coordination working group is established
- Governance and coordination mechanisms are defined
- Key policy questions are adopted
- A secretariat is established
- A communications structure is set up
Key stakeholders - Governance

Core group

Partners/ other interested bodies

- NGO
- Academia
- PAHO/WHO
- Ministry of Labour
- Ministry of Education
- Professional organisations
- Private sector
- ...
Groups identified

- Multistakeholder working group
  - Secretariat
    - MoH Focal point
    - Communication team
    - Technical working group

Health Workforce department, WHO-HQ
1. Governmental “buy-in”

2. Governance

3. Scoping and planning

4. Legal framework

5. Data compilation and analysis

6. Validation

7. Dissemination

8. Process revision
### Step 3: Scoping and planning

**Objectives**

- Produce evidence of the state of HRH in the country as the foundation to the NHWA
- Develop a national and global dissemination plan
- Define the business plan of NHWA implementation, including gathering of catalytic funding for the initial phase

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Tasks and activities</th>
<th>Main outputs</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>The technical working group is complemented, if necessary, by co-opted external experts</td>
<td>A scoping analysis is conducted and the status of HRH provided</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A scoping analysis is conducted, NHWA indicators are reviewed, and a maturity model assessment is carried out on the NHWA online platform</td>
<td>Costing of first year of NHWA is prepared with a plan for a rolling budget</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A data analysis and dissemination plan is prepared in line with the key policy questions defined in step 2</td>
<td>An analysis plan is prepared</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A meeting of the multistakeholder working group is held to cost the first year and plan for a rolling budget for the NHWA</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Scoping analysis

Used in evidence mapping

- Map **rapidly** the **key concepts, sources** and types of evidence available (Arksey and O’Malley, 2005)

- **Synthesis** and analysis of a wide range of research and non-research material to provide greater **conceptual** clarity about a specific topic or field of evidence (Davis et al, 2009)

- **Contextualize** knowledge by identifying **what we know and do not know**, and then setting this within policy and practice contexts (Anderson et al, 2008)
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Attribute</th>
<th>Census</th>
<th>Labour Force Surveys</th>
<th>Health Facility Surveys</th>
<th>Routine administrative Sources (payrolls, HRH registries)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Complete count of health workforce</td>
<td>***</td>
<td>***</td>
<td>**</td>
<td>**</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Across sectors coverage (public, private)</td>
<td>***</td>
<td>***</td>
<td>*</td>
<td>**</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Disaggregated data (Age, Sex, Geographical)</td>
<td>***</td>
<td>**</td>
<td>**</td>
<td>**</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Capturing unemployment</td>
<td>*</td>
<td>***</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>*</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rigorous data collection / management</td>
<td>***</td>
<td>***</td>
<td>**</td>
<td>**</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Periodicity and regular updating</td>
<td>*</td>
<td>**</td>
<td>**</td>
<td>**</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Occupational data coding</td>
<td>*</td>
<td>**</td>
<td>**</td>
<td>**</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sampling errors</td>
<td>***</td>
<td>**</td>
<td>*</td>
<td>**</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tracking of workforce entry-to-exit</td>
<td>*</td>
<td>**</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>*</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tracking of in-service Training / Productivity)</td>
<td>-</td>
<td></td>
<td>***</td>
<td>*</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Accessibility to micro-data</td>
<td>**</td>
<td>***</td>
<td>**</td>
<td>*</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Relative cost</td>
<td>*</td>
<td>**</td>
<td>***</td>
<td>**</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
NHWA maturity assessment

Capacity of information system to generate NHWA indicators

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Organisation Unit</th>
<th>France</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Data Set</td>
<td>NHWA Maturity assessment</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Period</td>
<td>2016</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Filter on section</td>
<td>Show all sections</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**M01 - Active health workforce stock**

Does your country have data on

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Filter in section</th>
<th>Value</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Health occupations at national level?</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Health occupations by activity level data?</td>
<td>No value</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Health occupations at subnational level?</td>
<td>No value</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Health occupations by age group?</td>
<td>No value</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Health occupations by sex?</td>
<td>No value</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Health occupations by facility ownership?</td>
<td>No value</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Health occupations by facility type?</td>
<td>No value</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Health occupations by foreign-born?</td>
<td>No value</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Health occupations by foreign-trained?</td>
<td>No value</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Health and social sector employment?</td>
<td>No value</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Thank you