National Health Workforce Accounts – Indicators and sources of HRH data
# Health workforce reporting

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>SDG 3</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Indicator 3.c.1: Health worker density and distribution</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### GSHRH Global Milestones’ indicators

**Milestones 2020:** 6/7 milestone indicators from NHWA

- e.g. Health workforce registries to track stock, distribution, flows, demand, supply, capacity and remuneration

**Milestones 2030:** 4/6 milestone indicators from NHWA

- e.g. Density of health workers per 1000 population by cadre and by subnational level distribution

### Working for health and growth: investing in the health workforce (ComHEEG)

- Recommendation 10: Data, information and accountability (harmonization, analysis, strengthened evidence)

- Action C: Advance health labour market data, analysis and tracking in all countries

### PAHO regional reporting

- PAHO Plan of Action on HRH for universal access to heath and UHC 2018-2023

### Other reporting:

- The WHO Global Code of Practice on the International Recruitment of Health Personnel

- State of the World’s Nursing and State of the World’s Midwifery

---

*Country needs are the primary driver for the data collection*
NHWA Handbook defines both numeric and ‘capability’ indicators to support strategic workforce planning and global monitoring.

The indicators feed into three labour market components: education, labour force and serving population health needs.

**Countries can select and prioritize** NHWA indicators according to their specific needs and goals at a given time, and eventually work towards selecting and covering the entire NHWA with flexible approach → **Progressive implementation**

The more indicators available at national and subnational level, the better the overview of the health workforce landscape will be, along with the potential for more sophisticated analyses, more efficient health workforce policies, and progress towards UHC.
The concept of the NHWA is closely aligned with the health labour market framework for UHC.
National Health Workforce Accounts: Modular overview

1. Active health workforce stock
   - Stock
     - Health worker density
     - Health worker density at subnational level
   - Distribution
     - Health worker distribution by age group
     - Health worker distribution by facility ownership type
     - Health worker distribution by facility type
   - Migration
     - Share of foreign-born health workers
     - Share of foreign-trained health workers
   - Distribution
     - Share of workers across health and social sectors

2. Education and training
   - Applications
     - Master list of accredited health workforce education and training institutions
     - Duration of education and training
     - Applications for education and training
   - Admissions
     - Ratio of admissions to available places
     - Ratio of students to qualified educators for education and training
     - Exit / drop out
       - Exit / drop out rate from education and training programmes

3. Education and training regulation and accreditation
   - Regulation
     - Standards for the duration and content of education and training
   - Accreditation
     - Accreditation mechanisms for education and training institutions and their programmes
     - Standards for social accountability
     - Standards for social accountability effectively implemented

4. Education finances
   - Financing of higher education
     - Total expenditure on higher education
     - Total expenditure on health workforce education
     - Average tuition fee per student
   - Investment
     - Adequate budgetary resources for investments in transformative education
     - Education expenditure
     - Expenditure per graduate on health workforce education

5. Health labour market flows
   - Entry into labour market
     - Graduates starting practice within one year
     - Repatriation rate from domestic efforts
     - Entry rate of foreign health workers
   - Exit from labour market
     - Voluntary exit rate from health labour market
     - Involuntary exit rate from health labour market

6. Employment characteristics and working conditions
   - Working time
     - Standard working hours
     - Health workers with a part-time contract
     - Hours worked per week
     - Hours worked per year
   - Labour market characteristics
     - Health worker status in employment
     - Regulation on dual practice
     - Regulation on compulsory service
   - Working conditions
     - Measures to prevent attacks on health workers
     - Attacks on health-care system

Abbreviated name
Health worker distribution by age group

Dimension: Distribution

- Indicator name: Percentage of active health workers in different age groups
- Numerator: Number of active health workers in a specific age group
- Denominator: Total number of active health workers, defined in headcounts
- Disaggregation: By occupation
- Definition: Percentage of active health workers in the given age groups, by occupation.
  Age groups considered are the following: > 25, 25–34, 35–44, 45–54, 55–64, ≤ 65.
- Glossary:
  - Active health worker
  - Age group
  - Occupation
- Data reporting frequency: Annual
- Potential data sources:
  - Health workforce registry or database
  - Aggregate data from health facilities (routine administrative records, Health Management Information System, District Health Information System census and/or survey)
  - Professional council/chamber/association registers
  - Labour force surveys
  - Population census data
- Further information and related links:
- Additional references:
Module 1: Active health workforce stock

- Indicators on the **density and distribution of health workers** (geographical, by age and by sex, institutional sector and facility types), which allows monitoring progress towards halving inequalities in access to a health worker (Global milestone 1, by 2030)

Potential data sources?

- Health workforce registry or database
- Health facilities
- Professional council/chamber/association registers
- Labour force surveys
### Education: Potential Sources of Data

#### 2.3 Ratio of Applications for Education and Training
- Ministry of Education
- Ministry of Higher Education
- Databases on education and training statistics
- Education and training institutions

#### 3.2 Accreditation Mechanisms for Education and Training Institutions and Their Programmes
- Ministry of Health
- Ministries of Education, Higher Education or similar
- National accreditation authorities
- Legitimate bodies, statutory corporations
- Professional council/chamber/association registers

#### 4.6 Cost per Graduate of Medical Specialist Education Programmes
- Ministry of Finance
- Ministry of Education
- Databases on education statistics
- Education and training institutions
5_5 Involuntary exit rate from health labour market

- Health workforce registry or database
- Professional council/chamber/association registers
- Aggregate data from health facilities
- Data from pension and/or retirement administration units
- Mortality records

6_6 Health worker status in employment

- Facility surveys
- Health worker registries
- Public service human resources and payroll administrations
- Labour force surveys

7_7 Gender wage gap

Wage and salaried workers (employees):
- Ministry of Health records
- Ministry of Finance records
- Payroll data
- Income tax data
- General labour force surveys
- Specific health worker surveys

Self-employed workers:
- Public/social health insurance
- Income tax data
- Specific health worker surveys
Serving population health needs: potential data sources

8_4 Specialist surgical workforce
- National labour force surveys
- National health workforce registries or databases
- National medical specialist registries or databases
- Population census data

9_1 Mechanisms to coordinate an intersectoral health workforce agenda
- Ministry of Health
- Subnational level ministries of health
- Institutions or units responsible for policies on health workforce
- Relevant ministries according to the national government structure and constitutional arrangements/level of devolution

10_4 HRHIS for reporting on outputs from education and training institutions
- Ministry of Health and regional ministries of health
- Professional chambers
- Institutions or units responsible for monitoring, or for policies on health workforce
- Ministry of Labour
- National Statistical Office

National Health Workforce Accounts – Indicators and sources of HRH data
Possible supporting indicators for geographical distribution of the health workforce

Policy question:
What is the baseline distribution of health workers across the subnational disaggregation to account for assessing the difference in accessing health care?

Module 1 – Active health workforce stock:
1 – 02: Health worker density at subnational level

Module 5 – Health labour market flows:
5 – 06: Unemployment rate
5 – 07: Vacancy rate

Module 9 – Governance and health workforce policies:
9 – 05: Institutional models for assessing health care staffing needs

Module 10 – Health workforce information systems:
10 – 01: HRHIS for reporting on International Health Regulations
10 – 02: HRHIS for WHO Code of Practice reporting
10 – 06: HRHIS for tracking the number of active stock on the labour market

## Key attributes of data sources

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Attribute</th>
<th>Census</th>
<th>Labour Force Surveys</th>
<th>Health Facility Surveys</th>
<th>Routine administrative Sources (payrolls, HRH registries)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Complete count of health workforce</td>
<td>***</td>
<td>***</td>
<td>**</td>
<td>**</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Across sectors coverage (public, private)</td>
<td>***</td>
<td>***</td>
<td>*</td>
<td>**</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Disaggregated data (Age, Sex, Geographical)</td>
<td>***</td>
<td>**</td>
<td>**</td>
<td>**</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Capturing unemployment</td>
<td>*</td>
<td>***</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>*</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rigorous data collection / management</td>
<td>***</td>
<td>***</td>
<td>**</td>
<td>**</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Periodicity and regular updating</td>
<td>*</td>
<td>**</td>
<td>**</td>
<td>**</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Occupational data coding</td>
<td>*</td>
<td>**</td>
<td>**</td>
<td>**</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sampling errors</td>
<td>***</td>
<td>**</td>
<td>*</td>
<td>**</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tracking of workforce entry-to-exit</td>
<td>*</td>
<td>**</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>*</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tracking of in-service Training / Productivity</td>
<td>-</td>
<td></td>
<td>***</td>
<td>*</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Accessibility to micro-data</td>
<td>**</td>
<td>***</td>
<td>**</td>
<td>*</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Relative cost</td>
<td>*</td>
<td>**</td>
<td>***</td>
<td>**</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Thank you.